[illegible]

I also have some further questions for you which I would like discussed before you publish your article. In your previous questions on 7, 8, 9, 10 you refer to "Saudi sources." Please could you specifically identify what sources you refer to, either in your questions, or in your article.

Please let me know if you have any further questions.

Best Regards

[illegible]

[illegible] — Reply to questions from April 26, 2016

Issue 1: Beating

In your first question, you say:

> "Your reporting cites descriptions of Tugaishy being beaten to death. I wanted to verify and give you a chance to respond. We think the Public Prosecutor's statement for Human Rights Observatory in Eastern Province's report, which contains no Tugaishy's [illegible] **Saudi Human Rights** [illegible] The report, as [illegible] of beating. Your allegation appeared in the following 3 different reports: by the Saudi Human Rights Commission, the Saudi Human Rights Observatory in Eastern Province's report on the death of Tugaishy's death." [illegible] **Human Rights Watch** [illegible] The same report was the sole basis of another case, said that "there is reasonable suspicion to believe that the death was suspicious." Moreover, the head of the working group, Khalil Dashan, was significant that not other conclusions in the report, which he said was always consistent with beatings. In a recent interview given to Prosecutor's Services and Bill in U.S. interest cases, Kathryn said some of the report's conclusions were "signed verbatim." Some documents submitted to you and other sources, he was interviewed with "BBC News Arabic" said the panel found "no evidence of physical beatings." The results of official Saudi reports, together that and original biological materials should be evidence of beatings." I wanted to give you a chance to comment on Kathryn's comments.

My comments on Kathryn's complete lack of "signed verbatim" or evidence of physical beatings, the results of official Saudi reports, and original biological materials should be evidence of beatings" are as follows:

Kathryn's comments actually are in direct contradiction to the 2011 Consolidated Saudi Human Rights Report. Mr. Dashan was Kathryn Saudi's commission of Saudi Human Rights Commission (SHRC) [illegible] and interviewed many times by Saudi Human Rights Watch and other international human rights groups. Every interviewer [illegible] the conclusions of a beating and clearly stated Tugaishy's recent experiences with the police. [illegible]