

Sergei Magnitsky died of badly treated illness; no evidence he was beaten **By Lucy Komisar**

William Browder has developed fanciful lies about Russian prison guards beating Sergei Magnitsky to death. He provides no evidence because there isn't any. In fact, the only legitimate reports says Magnitsky died of badly treated illness. Let's go through the evidence.

Browder has declared, "They chained him to a bed and eight riot guards with rubber batons beat him to death." Evidence? No, a Browder fabrication.

There were two important independent reports about Magnitsky in prison and death, one by the Russian Public Oversight Commission for Human Rights Observance, an NGO charged with investigating prison conditions, and the other by Physicians for Human Rights in Cambridge, Mass, to which Browder had given documents, including the POC report. Neither claims Magnitsky was tortured or beaten or even physically abused.

The [Public Oversight Commission](#) report November 16, 2009, the death of Magnitsky's death said: 6:30 p.m. Review by the doctor on duty. Diagnosis: Acute Cholecystitis and Pancreatitis. Hospitalized to the surgery department. For dynamic monitoring and treatment. 7:00 p.m. The patient behaves inadequately. Talks to a "voice," looks disorientated, and shouts that someone wants to kill him. He condition is diagnosed as psychosis. The emergency doctor was called (order No. 904253). There are no body damages apart from traces of handcuffs on the wrists. It was planned to make an anti-spasm therapy prior to the arrival of the psychiatrist but such therapy was not possible due to the aggressive behavior of the patient.

9:15 p.m. The patient was surveyed again as his condition deteriorated. When the psychiatrist was examining the patient the latter's condition deteriorated sharply. He lost conscience. The reanimation procedure was started (indirect heart massage and ventilation of lungs using the Ambu pillow). The patient was transferred to the special room where he was received an artificial ventilation of lungs and a hormones injection. Reanimation procedure lasted 30 minutes. At 9:50pm the patient died. The [report](#).

The Physicians for Human Rights, Cambridge, Mass. also made no claims of beating. The [report](#). The death stories were invented by Browder with zero evidence.

Yes, conditions were pretty bad. The building was over 100 years old and obviously had problems. Browder claimed that the toilet in the cell overflowed, doesn't mention the inmates were moved to other cells.

Perhaps of some relevance, I read in the [NY Times](#) that the U.S. is closing part of its Guantánamo facility that still holds 40 people for decades accused and never tried for acts of Islamic terrorism. It said: "The plan to consolidate the prisoners was devised during the Trump administration, when their [former compound, Camp 7, was failing](#). Raw sewage sloshed through the tiers, the power sometimes went out and some cell doors would not close at the site." So, sewage can be a problem in even newer prisons.

The European Court of Human Rights [report](#) also did not back up Browder's claim that Magnitsky had been tortured and beaten to death.

Here are the photos, as appeared in Russian forensic [report](#), taken the day after Magnitsky's death. Not someone beaten over an hour by 8 baton-wielding thugs.



Специалист _____ (подпись) _____ (Ф.И.О.)



Though the reports said nothing about a beating, and forensic photos showed no indications of a beating, that did not stop Browder. He simply fabricated "evidence" for his gullible or politically enthusiastic audience. He faked a death certificate claim,

highlighting “closed cerebral cranial injury,” to “prove” that Magnitsky must have been beaten on his head. But look at the real death certificate, that gives the lie to Browder’s forgery.



Browder’s manipulated (deep fake) death certificate, on his website.

November 17, 2009 12:13 From: To: 6940507 p. 1 48 (v)
 From: [illegible] IZ-77/1 city of Moscow Tel: 2696186 November 17, 2009 p. 2

FBU IZ-77/1
 UFSIN of Russia for Moscow

Hospital

Death CERTIFICATE

November 16, 2009

Department: Surgery Intensive Care Ward

We, the undersigned:

Attending physician: Captain of Internal Service A.V. Gaus

Duty nurse: Sergeant of Internal Service Ye.L. Vorobyeva

DPNSI [Duty assistant chief of the investigatory isolation ward]: Major of Internal Service D.F. Markov

Senior officer: Captain of Internal Service A.P. Pluzhnikov

Controller: Trainee Private M. Romanova

We certify death of Sergei Leonidovich Magnitsky, born in 1972, at 9:50 PM on November 16, 2009.

CAUSE OF DEATH: Toxic shock syndrome. Acute cardiovascular collapse.

DIAGNOSIS: Cholelithiasis. Acute calculous cholecystitis. Acute pancreatitis.
 Pancreatonecrosis? Acute psychosis. Closed craniocerebral injury?

No signs of a violent death detected.

No teeth of a yellow metal in the oral cavity.

Traces of injections – the result of treatment conducted.

Attending physician: [signature]

Duty nurse: [signature]

DPNSI: [signature]

Senior officer: [signature]

Controller: [signature]

The real death certificate.

Magnitsky's mother (a lot more honest than her son's pseudo-defender) told forensic investigators that her son had fallen and hit his head in 1993, 16 years earlier, and suffered a concussion, which was treated. The investigators found the medical reports and included them in the forensic document Browder received, so the shameless

prevaricator knew his connection of a cranial injury to the invented Magnitsky beating was a fabrication. Here's what the forensic report said:

Abstract from the inpatient medical record – injury on 04.02.1993, admitted on February 11, 1993, discharged on February 25, 1993. Diagnosis: Closed craniocerebral injury. Medium severity brain contusion. Linear skull roof and base fracture. Injury after fall. The patient lost consciousness and vomited. At the time of admission to the Neurosurgical Department the patient's condition is satisfactory. Physically there are no abnormalities. Neurological status: general brain and light meningeal symptomatology, VII, XII nn. S., Ng expressed. Disordered statics, anisoreflexia, vegetal lability. The skull R-gram: linear fracture of the frontal bone on the right towards the base of the anterior cranial fossa. Echoencephalography: no Me deviation. Treatment... Discharged in a satisfactory condition, after considerable improvement, to be attended by the neurologist...

Examination on March 5, 1993 – approached with the complains of the headache, pains at the base of the neck, increased fatigability. The medical background includes brain concussion (with the retrograde amnesia). Since that time is disturbed with the pains in the right temporal region and at the base of the neck. The pains are of constricting type and are related to long time sitting and mental strain; periodically suffers from the pains in the right side of the neck. Objectively – a restricted and painful rotation of the head to the right. The occipital muscle points of insertion are very painful. There are active trigger points in the trapezius muscle and in the clavisternomastoid one with the radiation to the right temporal region and the eyesocket. Unit C0-C1 on the right. Diagnosis: cranialgia, extravertebral myotonic syndrome with the underlying servical spine osteochondrosis. The subsequent effect of the trauma. Therapy includes: manual therapy, laser reflex therapy, trigger area blocking measures, isometric relaxation.

Examination on 31.03.1993 - tThe patient states 50% effectiveness. Headaches are less

P 29 of forensic [report](#) 211-8-17 Medical Expert 555/10, English translation that Browder provided to Physicians for Human Rights, Cambridge, Mass.

Interesting that Browder didn't start out making the beating claim, which is specified in the [Magnitsky Act](#). Check the [text](#) of his talk at Chatham House in London or the [video](#) of his talk at San Diego Law School. Here's how that progressed.

1 Man, 5 Stories, 0 Credibility

"I don't know whether they killed him deliberately or if he died of neglect"
12/15/2009 Chatham House Roundtable
<http://tinyurl.com/y99xqrlu>

"The put him in an isolation cell with a doctor outside the door until he died."
Summer 2010, The Magnitsky Act – Behind the Scenes
<http://magnitskyact.com/>

"They put him in a straitjacket, put him in an isolation room, & waited outside the door until he died"
12/6/2010 San Diego University Law
<http://tinyurl.com/y9gc4yjs>

They put him in an isolation cell, tied him to a bed, & then allowed 8 riot guards to beat him with rubber batons until he was dead
12/13/2011 University of Cambridge Business School
<http://tinyurl.com/y3wqwi5s>

"They put him in an isolation cell, chained him to a bed, and 8 riot guards came in and beat him with rubber batons"
7/26/17 Senate Judiciary Committee Testimony
<http://tinyurl.com/yagtadwh>

Bill Browder on how Sergei Magnitsky died

How Browder changed his stories about how Magnitsky died, graphic by Michael Thau.

As one can see, Browder said at Chatham House in 2009 that he didn't know how Magnitsky died and at the University of Diego Law School in 2010 that he'd been put in an isolation cell and left to die.

He didn't invent the beating till December 2011 when, with the collaboration of former State Department official Jonathan Winer, he was lobbying for the Magnitsky Act, really the William Browder Protection Act, aimed at using U.S. power to block the Russians for going after him for massive tax evasion and theft.